DeKalb County Historic Preservation Commission

Tuesday, January 16th, 2024 - 6:00 P.M.

Staff Report

Regular Agenda

J. 1325 Emory Road. Dave Price. Construct detached accessory dwelling unit and garage. Remove and fill in driveway. Install rear retaining wall and fencing. Remove and replace trees. **1246819**.

Built 1947 – Nonhistoric (18 054 12 001)

This property is located in the Druid Hills Character Area #2 and the Druid Hills National Register Historic District.

- 01-19 1325 Emory Road (DH), Dave Howe. Comment only on demolition of the house. 1243055. For comment only.
- 1325 Emory Road N.E., Dave Price Price Residential Design. Demolish underground garage and driveway with retaining walls. Construct new garage and new parking with gravel driveway. Build addition and rear porch and deck. Install pool, retaining walls and fence. Removal and replanting of trees. 1246301. **Deferred.**
- 03-23 1325 Emory Road N.E., Dave Price Price Residential Design. Demolish underground garage and driveway with retaining walls. Construct new garage and new parking with gravel driveway. Build addition and rear porch and deck. Install pool, retaining walls and fence. Removal and replanting of trees. 1246301. **Denied.**
- 1325 Emory Road, Dave Price Price Residential Design. Fill in the driveway, build a 1½-story rear addition, build an apartment/basement garage accessory structure at the right rear corner of the house, install driveway and retaining walls, add retaining wall and privacy fence in rear yard, and replace doors and windows. 1246398. **Deferred.**
- 1325 Emory Road, Dave Price Price Residential Design. Fill in the driveway, build a 1½-story rear addition, build an apartment/basement garage accessory structure at the right rear corner of the house, install driveway and retaining walls, add retaining wall and privacy fence in rear yard, and replace doors and windows. 1246398. **Approved.**

Summary

The applicant proposes amending a Certificate of Appropriateness that was approved and issued in May of 2023 to build a $1\frac{1}{2}$ story addition on the right and rear of the property, construct a connect accessory building at the right rear corner of the new addition, install a retaining wall behind the main property, install a 6' tall wood privacy fence behind the property and a 4' tall metal fence in the side yard, remove nine trees, and plant three replacement trees.

The amended application proposes that the approved attached garage addition and the attached accessory dwelling building now be unattached and constructed at the rear of the right side yard. The design of the accessory dwelling unit and garage are unchanged from the approved application. There will be no additions constructed onto the main building.

The approved retaining wall, fencing, and tree removal and planning are still proposed as they were in the issued Certificate of Appropriateness. The approved window replacement, door modification, and construction of a deck for the main building are still proposed as they were in the issued Certificate of Appropriateness.

Recommendation

Approve. These proposed changes do not appear to have a substantial adverse effect on the district. This application appears to meet the guidelines and the staff recommends approval.

Relevant Guidelines

- 5.0 Design Review Objective (p45) When making a material change to a structure that is in view from a public right-of-way, a higher standard is required to ensure that design changes are compatible with the architectural style of the structure and retain character-defining features. When a proposed material change to a structure is not in view from the public-right-way, the Preservation Commission may review the project with a less strict standard so as to allow the owner more flexibility. Such changes, however, shall not have a substantial adverse effect on the overall architectural character of the structure.
- Additions & New Construction Preserving Form & Layout The Druid Hills Local Historic District continues to change and evolve over time. For this area to meet contemporary needs, additions are built, uses change, and new buildings are constructed. The challenge is not to prevent change but to ensure that, when it does inevitably happen, it is compatible with the historic character of the area.

A new building is compatible with its historic setting when it borrows design characteristics and materials from adjacent buildings and integrates them into a modern expression. Before undertaking new development, be it a new building or changes or additions to existing buildings, take time to evaluate what makes the property and the neighborhood distinctive. Evaluate what type of impact the new development will have on the property and neighborhood. Decide how the development can best be designed to complement the property and area.

The underlying guideline for new construction and additions is to consider one's neighbors and nearby structures and reinforce the existing historic character through sensitive, compatible design.

Note that many of these guidelines refer to new development or new construction but are equally applicable to additions to existing buildings

- 7.1 Defining the Area of Influence (p64) <u>Guideline</u> In considering the appropriateness of a design for a new building or addition in a historic district, it is important to determine the area of influence. This area should be that which will be visually influenced by the building, i.e. the area in which visual relationships will occur between historic and new construction.
- 7.2 Recognizing the Prevailing Character of Existing Development (p65) Guideline When looking at a series of historic buildings in the area of influence, patterns of similarities may emerge that help define the predominant physical and developmental characteristics of the area. These patterns must be identified and respected in the design of additions and new construction.
- 7.2.1 Building Orientation and Setback (p66) <u>Guideline</u> The orientation of a new building and its site placement should appear to be consistent with dominant patterns within the area of influence, if such patterns are present.
- 7.2.2 Directional Emphasis (p67) <u>Guideline</u> A new building's directional emphasis should be consistent with dominant patterns of directional emphasis within the area of influence, if such patterns are present.
- 7.2.3 Shape: Roof Pitch (p68) <u>Guideline</u> The roof pitch of a new building should be consistent with those of existing buildings within the area of influence, if dominant patterns are present.
- 7.2.3 Shape: Building Elements (p68) <u>Guideline</u> The principal elements and shapes used on the front facade of a new building should be compatible with those of existing buildings in the area of influence, if dominant patterns are present.
- 7.2.3 Shape: Porch Form (p68) <u>Guideline</u> The shape and size of a new porch should be consistent with those of existing historic buildings within the area of influence, if dominant patterns are present.
- 7.2.4 Massing (p69) <u>Guideline</u> The massing of a new building should be consistent with dominant massing patterns of existing buildings in the area of influence, if such patterns are present.

- 7.2.5 Proportion (p70) <u>Guideline</u> The proportions of a new building should be consistent with dominant patterns of proportion of existing buildings in the area of influence, if such patterns are present.
- 7.2.6 Rhythm (p71) <u>Guideline</u> New construction in a historic area should respect and not disrupt existing rhythmic patterns in the area of influence, if such patterns are present.
- 7.2.7 Scale/Height (p72) Guideline New construction in historic areas should be consistent with dominant patterns of scale within the area of influence, if such patterns are present. Additions to historic buildings should not appear to overwhelm the existing building.
- 7.2.7 Scale/Height (p72) <u>Guideline</u> A proposed new building should appear to conform to the floor-to-floor heights of existing structures if there is a dominant pattern within the established area of influence. Dominant patterns of cornice lines, string courses, and water tables can be referenced to help create a consistent appearance.
- 9.6 Accessory Buildings (p91) Guideline New accessory buildings, such as garages and storage houses, are to be located in rear yard spaces and visually buffered from adjacent property owners and the public right-of-way. Accessory buildings that complement the architecture of the adjacent residence do not require the same level of buffering and may remain more visible within the local district. If the new building will be visible from the street, it should respect the established setbacks and orientations of the historic buildings in the area.
- 11.0 Nonhistoric Properties (p93) <u>Guideline</u> In reviewing an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a material change to a nonhistoric building, the Preservation Commission should evaluate the change for its potential impacts to any historic development (architecture and natural and cultural landscapes) in the area of influence of the nonhistoric property. Guidelines presented in *Section 7.0: Additions and new Construction* are relevant to such evaluations.