

April 25, 2020-Revised

Dianne McNabb, Director of Finance/Chief Financial Officer
1300 Commerce Drive, 6th Floor
Decatur, Georgia 30030

Benitia Ransom, Director of Human Resources
1300 Commerce Drive, 1st Floor
Decatur, Georgia 30030

RE: Finance-Utility Customer Operations Audit of Temporary Personnel Services
Contract, Audit Report Number. 2017-013-UCO - Audit Follow-up Report

Dear Director McNabb and Director Ransom:

As required by DeKalb County, Georgia – Code of Ordinances / Organizational Act Section 10A- Independent Internal Audit (I), I have attached the Office of Independent Internal Audit's report on the status of actions taken by your office to address the findings contained in the audit report referenced above.

The three findings/recommendations(1,2&3) related to finance in this report have been implemented pending verification by the Office of Independent Internal Audit.

The two finding/ recommendations(2&3) related to Human Resource in this report have been implemented pending verification by the Office of Independent Internal Audit.

Please contact me if you require additional information.

Sincerely,



John L. Greene, CIA, CIG, CGAP, CGFM
Chief Audit Executive

Attachment

cc. Michael L. Thurmond, Chief Executive Officer
Nancy Jester, Board of Commissioners District 1
Jeff Rader, Board of Commissioners District 2
Larry Johnson, Board of Commissioners District 3

Steve Bradshaw, Board of Commissioners District 4
Mereda Davis Johnson, Board of Commissioners District 5
Kathie Gannon, Board of Commissioners District 6
Lorraine Cochran-Johnson, Board of Commissioners District 7
La'Keitha D. Carlos, Chief of Staff
Vacant, Board of Commissioners Chief of Staff
Zachary L. Williams, Chief Operating Officer
Harmel Codi, Chairperson, Audit Oversight Committee
Adrienne T. McMillion, Vice-Chairperson, Audit Oversight Committee
Claire Cousins, Audit Oversight Committee
Lisa Earls, Audit Oversight Committee
Harold Smith, Audit Oversight Committee

Dekalb County Government			
Office of Independent Internal Audit			
Audit Findings Status Update Form			
Status Date		Report #	Report Title
4/25/20		2017-013-UCO	Temporary Personnel Services Contract
Contact Person		Title	Phone No.
Dianne McNabb/Monifa Yarborough		Director of Finance/Utility Operations Analyst	404-371-2745/404-687-3981
			Email Address
			dmcnabb@dekalbcountyga.gov
Activity		Accountability	Schedule
Finance - Utility Customer Operations		Responsible Area	Anticipated Completion Date/Date Adjustments will be made
		Finance - Utility Customer Operations	No
Finding		Finding Detail - LOW RETENTION RATE AMONG TEMPORARY HIRES	
No.	1		
Date	10/19/18		
Recommendation		<p>Utility Customer Operations (UCO) Management should:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increase the hourly rate to be competitive with the market, introduce morale programs, worker incentives, and/or mentoring program, provide coaching/feedback, lower stress from overworking and foster a work/life balance to reduce the low retention rate of temporary staff. • Analyze the data to identify employee retention rates among the temporary personnel service vendors and work with the vendors to improve recruitment of candidates. 	
Management Response		<p>The Department of Finance, Utility Customer Operations ("UCO") recognized the turnover activity and created the Top Performers Program. The goals of the Top Performers program are to improve retention, encourage professional development and create greater opportunities for transferable knowledge. The UCO implemented the Top Performers Program in June 2017. The Top Performers program identifies high performing temporary staff and positions eligible candidates for time-limited employment with the County. The current median tenure for the customer service team is 15 months, up from 9.5 months in August 2017. The improvement in workforce stabilization is attributed to the implementation of the Top Performers Program. The new hire training programs are 6-9 week training classes that consist of assessments, LIFT (Leveraging Interactions by Focusing on Techniques) exercises, phone lab, video learning and scenario-based exercises. These enhancements support a highly skilled workforce, stabilized professional environment and increased morale. Data collected during the training classes are used to establish standards for attracting top talent.</p> <p>Within the entire UCO, 48 employees have converted from temporary personnel status to time limited employment.</p> <p>The UCO encourages morale enhancing activities. The various teams participate in birthday recognition, seasonal celebrations, cross-functional acknowledgment of excellent work performance, and recognition in the departmental newsletter for meeting performance goals. The UCO participates in mentoring, coaching and development efforts that include one-on-ones and job shadowing. The County's UCO participated in professional development opportunities that provided exposure to leading industry practices. Employees participated in peer workdays with the City of Atlanta and attended the Customer Service Week Conference. These opportunities provided the County an opportunity to gain insight on best practices and industry trends. Employees participating in professional development activities have increased confidence in their work and feel better equipped to perform their jobs with excellence. Additionally, employees have been encouraged to pursue opportunities to engage in high priority projects such as the new billing system implementation.</p> <p>In Q2 2018, the amount of overtime reduced 11% from Q1 2018. The reduction in overtime helps to establish appropriate work/life balance. Additionally, for the UCO, a reduction in overtime is an indicator of stabilized productivity and work efficiency.</p> <p>In February 2018, the Board of Commissioners approved CEO Michael Thurmond's budget recommendation that included increasing salaries for all county employees whose salaries have not been adjusted since 2016 with a 3 percent increase in pay and establishing a minimum wage of \$14 per hour for all full-time and regular part-time employees. This action by the County leadership creates the foundation for establishing competitive pay rates.</p> <p>The UCO shares data and continues to work with the temporary agencies to identify best-fit candidates and improve vendor recruitment. The UCO conducts interviews of potential candidates prior the candidate participating in new hire training.</p>	
Status Update-12 months		The hourly rate for County employees increased to \$15 per hour in April 2018.	
<input type="checkbox"/>	Open	The median tenure of the customer service team increased from 9.5 months in August 2017 to 1.5 years in February 2020 and 73% of employees are employed by DeKalb County Government.	
<input type="checkbox"/>	Management/Agency Assumes Risk		
<input type="checkbox"/>	Partially Complete		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Complete Pending Verification by OIIA	Employees participated in DeKalb County-led Customer Service training and are encouraged to enroll in other County-led self-development courses. Scheduled new employee classes that align with seasonal call trends reduce the dependency on mandatory overtime in the customer service teams.	
<input type="checkbox"/>	Closed		
Status Update-Final		Time limited positions are offered to Top Performing contract employees and to the best qualified external candidates.	
<input type="checkbox"/>	Open		
<input type="checkbox"/>	Management/Agency Assumes Risk		
<input type="checkbox"/>	Partially Complete		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Complete Pending Verification by OIIA		
<input type="checkbox"/>	Closed		

Audit Findings Status Update Form

Status Date		Report #	Report Title	
4/25/20		2017-013-UCO	Temporary Personnel Services Contract	
Contact Person		Title	Phone No.	Email Address
Dianne McNabb/Monifa Yarborough/Benita Ransom		Director of Finance/Utility Operations Analyst/Director of Human Resources	404-371-2745/404-687-3981 /404-687-3588	dmcnabb@dekalbcountyga.gov bcransom@dekalbcountyga.gov
Activity		Accountability	Schedule	
Finance - Utility Customer Operations		Responsible Area	Repeat Finding	Anticipated Completion Date/Date Adjustments will be made
		Finance - Utility Customer Operations; Human Resources and Merit System	No	
Finding		Finding Detail-VENDOR NOT COMPLIANT WITH REQUIREMENT 17		
No.	2			
Date	10/19/18			
Recommendation		<p>UCO Management should:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ensure that information submitted by the vendor is complete and complies with the contract terms. <p>Human Resources and Merit System (HRMS) Management should:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ensure that the vendor complies with the contract terms. • Perform periodic reviews of temporary employee information/data acquired from the user departments and reconcile them with the data in the monthly management reports obtained from the vendor. • Reinforce to the user departments the vendor obligations and requirements of the contract by providing a summary of the vendor requirements on the Request for Temporary Services form to further encourage internal compliance. 		
Management Response		<p>Both vendors are now providing complete monthly management reports. User departments, and not HR, are responsible for reconciling timesheets with vendor invoices to prevent overbilling. To facilitate, HR has created a timesheet for user departments to capture temp work hours to better compare against invoices. Timesheet included. HR will continue to monitor contract expenditure to ensure vendor does not exceed authorized amount. User departments, vendor, and Purchasing will be notified in writing when vendor is approaching the contract limit.</p> <p>While the contract requires the vendor to report each department's utilization on a separate sheet, HR prefers a monthly listing of temporary assignments in Excel utilizing fields outlined in agreement. This allows HR to sort as needed i.e., by department, job title, date assigned etc.</p>		
Status Update-12 months		Utility Customer Operations Management's Response		
<input type="checkbox"/>	Open	Each individual timesheet is attached with the invoices and uploaded in Oracle for the approver to pay. Once approved a hard copy of the invoice is forwarded to accounts payable to be paid.		
<input type="checkbox"/>	Management/Agency Assumes			
<input type="checkbox"/>	Partially Complete			
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Complete Pending Verification b	Human Resource and System Management's Response		
<input type="checkbox"/>	Closed	HR is receiving monthly reports from the vendors. Sample timesheet posted on HR's Intranet page. <input type="checkbox"/>		
Status Update-Final				
<input type="checkbox"/>	Open			
<input type="checkbox"/>	Management/Agency Assumes			
<input type="checkbox"/>	Partially Complete			
<input type="checkbox"/>	Complete Pending Verification b			
<input type="checkbox"/>	Closed			

Audit Findings Status Update Form

Status Date		Report #	Report Title	
4/25/20		2017-013-UCO	Temporary Personnel Services Contract	
Contact Person		Title	Phone No.	Email Address
Dianne McNabb/Monifa Yarborough/Benita Ransom		Director of Finance/Utility Operations Analyst/Director of Human Resources	404-371-2745/404-687 3981 /404-687-3588	dmcnabb@dekalbcountyga.gov bcransom@dekalbcountyga.gov
Activity		Accountability	Schedule	
Finance - Utility Customer Operations		Responsible Area	Repeat Finding	Anticipated Completion Date/Date Adjustments will be made
		Finance - Utility Customer Operations; Human Resources and Merit System	No	
Finding		Finding Detail-VENDOR NOT COMPLIANT WITH REQUIREMENTS 18 and 19		
No.	3			
Date	10/19/18			
Recommendation		UCO Management should: • Ensure that information submitted by the vendor is complete and complies with the contract terms. As mentioned in the recommendation for Finding No. 2, HRMS should: • Reinforce to the user departments the vendor obligations and requirements of the contract by providing a summary of the vendor requirements on the Request for Temporary Services form to further encourage internal compliance.		
Management Response		HR will review vendor timesheet and invoice formats and recommend changes to reflect requirements outlined in the contract. In the interim, HR has developed a sample invoice and timesheet, which reflect the following fields contained in the agreement: 1.Division/department number 2.Invoice number 3.Purchase order number 4.Week-ending date and invoice date 5.Description of job title 6.Employee name 7.Hours worked, hourly billed rate, and total amount due for each employee; and 8.Invoice totals to include total hours and total payment Vendors will be advised to remove personal identifiable information from all documents. In lieu of adding a summary of vendor obligations and requirements on the Request for Temporary Services form, HR has added a link on the form that will connect users to the contract terms now posted on HR's Intranet site.		
Status Update-12 months		Utility Customer Operations Management's Response Each individual timesheet is attached with the invoices and uploaded in Oracle for the approver to pay. Once approved a hard copy of the invoice is forwarded to accounts payable to be paid. Human Resource and System Management's Response Vendor requirements posted on HR Intranet page, along with relevant information related to temporary personnel services.		
<input type="checkbox"/>	Open			
<input type="checkbox"/>	Management/Agency Assumes Risk			
<input type="checkbox"/>	Partially Complete			
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Complete Pending Verification by OIIA			
<input type="checkbox"/>	Closed			
Status Update-Final				
<input type="checkbox"/>	Open			
<input type="checkbox"/>	Management/Agency Assumes Risk			
<input type="checkbox"/>	Partially Complete			
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Complete Pending Verification by OIIA			
<input type="checkbox"/>	Closed			